SEMATE TAXATION	
EXHIBIT NO	7
DATE 1-24-07	,
BUL NO. 58-24	12

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA

NO. 05-336

JIM ELLIOTT,

Petitioner/Appellant,

-VS-

THE MONTANA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE,

Respondent/Respondent,

MONTANA TAXPAYERS' ASSOCIATION,

Intervenor.



OCT 1 4 2005

Smith

INTERVENOR'S RESPONSE BRIEF

CLERK OF THE SUPREME CO STATE OF MONTANA

ON APPEAL FROM THE FIRST JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT LEWIS AND CLARK COUNTY, Cause No. CDV-2004-777

Appearances

Peter Michael Meloy Robin A. Meguire Meloy Trieweiler 80 South Warren P.O. Box 1241 Helena, MT 59624 Attorneys for Petitioner/Appellant David L. Ohler Special Assistant Attorney General Montana Department of Revenue 125 N. Roberts, 4th Floor P.O. Box 7741 Helena, MT 59604-7701 Attorneys for Respondents

John Alke Cherche Prezeau Hughes, Kellner, Sullivan & Alke, PLLP 40 W. Lawrence, Suite A P.O. Box 1166 Helena, MT 59624-1166 Attorneys for Intervenor Montana Taxpayers' Association B. 26 U.S.C. § 6103(a) and § 6103(p)(8) prohibit the State of Montana from disclosing federal tax return information that is contained on a state tax return form.

Federal law expressly prohibits an employee of the State of Montana from publicly disclosing federal income tax returns or federal return information:

- (a) General rule. Returns and return information shall be confidential, and except as authorized by this title---
 - (2) no officer or employee of any State, any local law enforcement agency receiving information under subsection (1)(7)(A), any local child support enforcement agency, or any local agency administering a program listed in subsection (1)(7)(D) who has or had access to returns or return information under this section.

shall disclose any return information obtained by him in any manner in connection with his service as such an officer or an employee or otherwise or under the provisions of this section. For purposes of this subsection, the term "officer or employee" includes a former officer or employee.

26 U.S.C. § 6103(a). Federal law broadly defines the term "return information" to include such basic information as the taxpayer's identity and the nature, source, or amount of its taxable income:

(A) a taxpayer's identity, the nature, source, or amount of his income, payments, receipts, deductions, exemptions, credits, assets, liabilities, net worth, tax liability, tax withheld, deficiencies, overassessments, or tax payments, whether the taxpayer's return was, is being, or will be examined or subject to other investigation or processing, or any other data, received by, recorded by, prepared by, furnished to, or collected by the Secretary with respect to a return or with respect to the determination of the existence, or possible existence, of liability (or the amount thereof) of any person under this title for any tax, penalty, interest, fine, forfeiture, or other imposition, or offense,

26 U.S.C. § 6103(b)(2). These provisions are specifically intended "to regulate and restrict access to tax returns and return information by the many government bodies and agencies that routinely had access to such information under former section 6103." *Chamberlain v. Kurtz*, 589 F.2d 827-835-6 (5th Cir. 1979). *See also Church of Scientology of California v. Internal Revenue Serv.*, 484 U.S. 9, 16 (1987) ("One of the major purposes in revising § 6103 was to tighten the restrictions on the use of return information by entities other than the [Internal Revenue Service]").

A special federal requirement applies when a state requires attachment of the federal income tax return to the state income return:

(8) State law requirements. (A) Safeguards. Notwithstanding any other provision of this section, no return or return information shall be disclosed after December 31, 1978, to any officer or employee of any State which requires a taxpayer to attach to, or include in, any State tax return a copy of any portion of his Federal return, or information reflected on such Federal return, unless such State adopts provisions of law which protect the confidentiality of the copy of the Federal return (or portion thereof) attached to, or the Federal return information reflected on, such State tax return.

26 U.S.C. § 6103(p)(8)(emphasis added). Accordingly, when Montana chose to require attachment of the federal return, it obligated itself to protect against the public disclosure of federal return information reflected on the state return form.

Faced with these clear expressions of binding federal law, and the undisputed facts, the District Court correctly held that "by tying its corporate tax system to the federal system, Montana has subjected itself to the requirements of federal law." Slip Op. at 10. The District Court necessarily held that the confidential tax information requested by Senator Elliott included federal return

Förcalendariyear/2	rporation 003 or tax year begin	n License 7	Tax Refurn 3 ending	: MONTANA Form GET4 20 Rev. 8:03
Check if Comporation Name : Address : Initial Return		lf newladd	ress <u>checkinere</u>	FEIN: Federal Business Code
Final Return Gity		States	Zip+4	r Incorporated in State of Date
Reporting Method Cash Accrual		King Paranta and American Company of the Company of		Date Qualined in Mortana
1. Taxable income per federal return (line 28) (copy of 2. Add: a. Montana corporation license tax (attach be b. Other state, local, foreign, and franchise c. Federal tax exempt interest	reakdown of Federal taxes based on inco endowment credit . l 	Form 1120 line 17) 2a me 2b 2c .ncluded on line 2e 2f	Form 8873, lin	2 1. Form 1120 E 52-carries to line 26, Form 1121
3. Subtract: a. IRC Section 243 dividend received d b. Nonbusiness income (a detailed breakdo c. Other reductions (a detailed breakdo d. Montana recycling deduction (attach	wn must be attached	ched) 3b	Various lines o	form 1120, if applicable
 4. Adjusted taxable income (line 1 + line 2 - line 3) 5. Income apportioned to Montana (line 4 × 6. Income allocated directly to Montana (multi-state taxable) 	% from Schedule	K, line 5) . MW fi-s.	tate taxpayers	3.
7. Montana taxable income before net operating loss If line 7 is a loss, do you wish to forego the net ope If a loss is reported on line 7 and neither box is It a loss is reported on line 3 and neither box is It and net operating loss carryover (a detailed s	(line 5 + line 6 or enerating loss carrybac checked, the loss m chedule must be atta	nter amount reported on k provision? Yes [ust be carried back.eched)	line 4)	7.
9 Not to be less than the minimum tax liability of \$500 Not to be less than the minimum tax liability of \$50	for those corporation	ns electing a water's edo	ge filing)	9.
each corporation with Montana activity 11. Subtract: a. 2002 overpayment b. Tentative payment		11a	· · ·	Special election If MT sales < 100,000 and no property or
c. Quarterly estimated tax payments Total payments		11c		payroll factors are
 12. Subtract: Credits (from Schedule C)	ayment with the coup	on provided in the book	let	12. 13.
 14. Interest from due date @ 12% per annum 15. Estimated tax underpayment interest penalty (attaction). 16. Penalty: a. Late filing penalty (see instructions) . 				14.
b. Late payment penalty (see instruction Total penalty payment)			16. 17.
18. Overpayment to be credited to 2004 estimated tax 19. Refund due Check here if you do not need the Montana Corpor				18. 19.
Declaration This return must be signed by one of the following: pres officer of the corporation for which this return, is made, it best of my knowledge and belief, a true, correct and corporation license tax law and regulations.	ident, vice-president	ons on page 2 of this for the contract the c	orm asurer, or chief account	ting officer. I, the undersigned es and statements, is, to the uant to the Montana
e of officer	Date	Name of person or fir	m preparing return	Date
C- 15	Telephone number	Address and Zip Cod		Telephone number

c hedule:	ik				
		Apportionmer	it:Factors for Multistate	Taxpayers	Year
Use Lar	Everyuse Factor: e average value for real and	V and tangible pedule L. Form	11170	B. Montana V not specifi from for	C. Factor (B divided by A = C) cally 1120, federal
Ma Equ Fur Inv Sup	ildings Line 104, Scichinery uipment Initure and fixtures. entories Line 3,50 pplies and other Line. nts × 8 Line II Total Property	ncdule L. For b, Schedule L e, Form 112	m 1120		return
Payroll		Line 12, For Line 13, For	(1120		
Sales (C Gro Oth	Gross Receipts) Factor oss sales, less returns . ner (attach schedule) Total Sales	Line	lc, Form 1120 pme from specific 1	ines on Form 112	20, such as lines 6, %
5. Apporti	Factors (add lines 1, 2 onment Factor (1/3 of ere and on line 5, page	ine 4; if less th	an 3 factors exist, see ii	nstructions)	%
	p questions are required Did you at the end of the stock of a domestic concorned. Line 3,	ne taxable year poration? If "ye	Own directly or indirect	thy 50% or mara of the	outstanding voting s, and percentage
es No 2.	Were you a U.S. share showing name, addres	holder of any c	ontrolled foreign corner	ation? If "yes," you mu	st attach a schedule
s No 3.	Did any individual, part indirectly, 50% or more and percentage owned	OH WIND WINDS	ration, estate, or trust at stock? If "yes," you mus Schedule K, For		year own, directly or nowing name, address,
s No 4.	If the answer to question end of the taxable year	on 3 is "yes," di also own, dire	d the same individual, p ctly or indirectly, 50% or attach a schedule of the	artnership, corporation	ok of anather 1
 	Check applicable filing group.) Separate Compa Separate Accour Worldwide Combi Domestic Combination	method: (Pleasent) Any Apportionmenting Dination Nation Stion	se note: Combined filing		

§ 6101. Period covered by returns or other documents.

When not otherwise provided for by this title, the Secretary may by regulations prescribe the period for which, or the date as of which, any return, statement, or other document required by this title or by regulations, shall be made.

(Aug. 16, 1954, ch 736, 68A Stat. 753; Oct. 4, 1976, P. L. 94-455, Title XIX, § 1906(b)(13)(A),

HISTORY; ANCILLARY LAWS AND DIRECTIVES

Amendments:

In 1976, P.L. 94-455, Sec. 1906(b)(13)(A), substituted "Secretary" for "Secretary or his delegate" in Code Sec. 6101, effective 2/1/77.

CODE OF FEDERAL REGULATIONS

Internal Revenue Service, Department of the Treasury-Excise tax procedural regulations, 26 CFR Part

Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco and Firearms, Department of the Treasury-Manufacturers excise taxesfirearms and ammunition, 27 CFR Part 53.

INTERPRETIVE NOTES AND DECISIONS

Object of payment on account of income tax, and its consequent allocation to taxes assessed for various periods, is in each instance defined by the intention of taxpayer, to be ascertained from all relevant facts and circumstances: to determine such intention court may look to returns filed, even though they erroneously

embraced period which did not coincide with the fiscal period for which return was prescribed. American Hide & Leather Co. v United States (1932) 284 US 343, 76 L Ed 331, 52 S Ct 154, 3 USTC \P 855, 10 AFTR 775.

§ 6102. Computations on returns or other documents.

- (a) Amounts shown on Internal Revenue forms. The Secretary is authorized to provide with respect to any amount required to be shown on a form prescribed for any internal revenue return, statement, or other document, that if such amount of such item is other than a whole-dollar amount,
 - (1) the fractional part of a dollar shall be disregarded; or
 - (2) the fractional part of a dollar shall be disregarded unless it amounts to one-half dollar or more, in which case the amount (determined without regard to the fractional part of a dollar)
- (b) Election not to use whole dollar amounts. Any person making a return, statement, or other document shall be allowed, under regulations prescribed by the Secretary, to make such return, statement, or other document without regard to subsection (a).
- (c) Inapplicability to computation of amount. The provisions of subsections (a) and (b) shall not be applicable to items which must be taken into account in making the computations necessary to determine the amount required to be shown on a form, but shall be applicable only to such final

(Aug. 16, 1954, ch 736, 68A Stat. 753; Oct. 4, 1976, P. L. 94-455, Title XIX, § 1906(b)(13)(A),

HISTORY; ANCILLARY LAWS AND DIRECTIVES

Amendments:

In 1976, P.L. 94-455, Sec. 1906(b)(13)(A), substituted "Secretary" for "Secretary or his delegate' each place it appeared in Code Sec. 6102, effective 2/1/77.

CODE OF FEDERAL REGULATIONS

Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco and Firearms, Department of the Treasury-Manufacturers excise taxesfirearms and ammunition, 27 CFR Part 53.

Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco and Firearms, Department of the Treasury-Procedure and administration,

RESEARCH GUIDE

Am Jur:

33 Am Jur 2d, Federal Taxation (2002) § 1716.

§ 6103. Confidentiality and disclosure of returns and return information.

- (a) General rule. Returns and return information shall be confidential, and except as authorized
 - (1) no officer or employee of the United States,
 - (2) no officer or employee of any State, any local law enforcement agency receiving information under subsection (i)(7)(A), any local child support enforcement agency, or any local agency

administering a program listed in subsection (l)(7)(D) who has or had access to returns or return information under this section, and

(3) no other person (or officer or employee thereof) who has or had access to return or return information under subsection (e)(1)(D)(iii), paragraph (6), (12), or (16) of subsection (1), paragraph (2) or (4)(B) of subsection (m), or subsection (n),

shall disclose any return or return information obtained by him in any manner in connection with his service as such an officer or an employee or otherwise or under the provisions of this section. For purposes of this subsection, the term "officer or employee" includes a former officer or employee.

- (b) Definitions. For purposes of this section—
 - (1) Return. The term "return" means any tax or information return, declaration of estimated tax, or claim for refund required by, or provided for or permitted under, the provisions of this title which is filed with the Secretary by, on behalf of, or with respect to any person, and any amendment or supplement thereto, including supporting schedules, attachments, or lists which are supplemental to, or part of, the return so filed.
 - (2) Return information. The term "return information" means—
 - (A) a taxpayer's identity, the nature, source, or amount of his income, payments, receipts, deductions, exemptions, credits, assets, habilities, net worth, tax hability, tax withheld, deficiencies, overassessments, or tax payments, whether the taxpayer's return was, is being, or will be examined or subject to other investigation or processing, or any other data, received by, recorded by, prepared by, furnished to, or collected by the Secretary with respect to a return or with respect to the determination of the existence, or possible existence, of liability (or the amount thereof) of any person under this title for any tax, penalty, interest, fine, forfeiture, or other imposition, or offense,
 - (B) any part of any written determination or any background file document relating to such written determination (as such terms are defined in section 6110(b)) which is not open to public inspection under section 6110,
 - (C) any advance pricing agreement entered into by a taxpayer and the Secretary and any background information related to such agreement or any application for an advance pricing agreement, and
 - (D) any agreement under section 7121, and any similar agreement, and any background information related to such an agreement or request for such an agreement,

but such term does not include data in a form which cannot be associated with, or otherwise identify, directly or indirectly, a particular taxpayer. Nothing in the preceding sentence, or in any other provision of law, shall be construed to require the disclosure of standards used or to be used for the selection of returns for examination, or data used or to be used for determining such standards, if the Secretary determines that such disclosure will seriously impair assessment, collection, or enforcement under the internal revenue laws.

- (3) Taxpayer return information. The term "taxpayer return information" means return information as defined in paragraph (2) which is filed with, or furnished to, the Secretary by or on behalf of the taxpayer to whom such return information relates.
- (4) Tax administration. The term "tax administration"—
 - (A) means—
 - (i) the administration, management, conduct, direction, and supervision of the execution and application of the internal revenue laws or related statutes (or equivalent laws and statutes of a State) and tax conventions to which the United States is a party, and
 - (ii) the development and formulation of Federal tax policy relating to existing or proposed internal revenue laws, related statutes, and tax conventions, and
 - (B) includes assessment, collection, enforcement, litigation, publication, and statistical gathering functions under such laws, statutes, or conventions.
- (5) State. The term "State" means—
 - (A) any of the 50 States, the District of Columbia, the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico, the Virgin Islands, the Canal Zone, Guam. American Samoa, and the Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands, and
 - (B) for purposes of subsections (a)(2), (b)(4), (d)(1), (h)(4), and (p) any municipality—
 - (i) with a population in excess of 250,000 (as determined under the most recent decennial United States census data available),
 - (ii) which imposes a tax on income or wages, and
 - (iii) with which the Secretary (in his sole discretion) has entered into an agreement regarding disclosure.
- (6) **Taxpayer identity.** The term "taxpayer identity" means the name of a person with respect to whom a return is filed, his mailing address, his taxpayer identifying number (as described in section 6109), or a combination thereof.



- (7) Inspection. The terms "inspected" and "inspection" mean any examination of a return or return information.
- (8) Disclosure. The term "disclosure" means the making known to any person in any manner whatever a return or return information.
- Federal agency. The term "Federal agency" means an agency within the meaning of seca 551(1) of title 5, United States Code.
- (10) Chief executive officer. The term "chief executive officer" means, with respect to any municipality, any elected official and the chief official (even if not elected) of such municipality.
- (11) Terrorist incident, threat, or activity. The term "terrorist incident, threat, or activity" means an incident, threat, or activity involving an act of domestic terrorism (as defined in section 2331(5) of title 18, United States Code) or international terrorism (as defined in section 2331(1) of such title).
- (c) Disclosure of returns and return information to designee of taxpayer. The Secretary may, subject to such requirements and conditions as he may prescribe by regulations, disclose the return of any taxpayer, or return information with respect to such taxpayer, to such person or persons as the taxpayer may designate in a request for or consent to such disclosure, or to any other person at the taxpayer's request to the extent necessary to comply with a request for information or assistance made by the taxpayer to such other person. However, return information shall not be disclosed to such person or persons if the Secretary determines that such disclosure would seriously impair Federal tax administration.
- (d) Disclosure to State tax officials and State and local law enforcement agencies. (1) In general. Returns and return information with respect to taxes imposed by chapters 1, 2, 6, 11, 12, 21, 23, 24, 31, 32, 44, 51, and 52 and subchapter D of chapter 36 shall be open to inspection by, or disclosure to, any State agency, body, or commission, or its legal representative, which is charged under the laws of such State with responsibility for the administration of State tax laws for the purpose of, and only to the extent necessary in, the administration of such laws. including any procedures with respect to locating any person who may be entitled to a refund. Such inspection shall be permitted, or such disclosure made, only upon written request by the head of such agency, body, or commission, and only to the representatives of such agency, body, or commission designated in such written request as the individuals who are to inspect r to receive the returns or return information on behalf of such agency, body, or commission. Such representatives shall not include any individual who is the chief executive officer of such State or who is neither an employee or legal representative of such agency, body, or commission nor a person described in subsection (n). However, such return information shall not be disclosed to the extent that the Secretary determines that such disclosure would identify a confidential informant or seriously impair any civil or criminal tax investigation.
 - Disclosure to State audit agencies. (A) In general. Any returns or return information obtained under paragraph (1) by any State agency, body, or commission may be open to inspection by, or disclosure to, officers and employees of the State audit agency for the purpose of, and only to the extent necessary in, making an audit of the State agency, body, or commission referred to in paragraph (1).
 - (B) State audit agency. For purposes of subparagraph (A), the term "State audit agency" means any State agency, body, or commission which is charged under the laws of the State with the responsibility of auditing State revenues and programs.
 - (3) Exception for reimbursement under section 7624. Nothing in this section shall be construed to prevent the Secretary from disclosing to any State or local law enforcement agency which may receive a payment under section 7624 the amount of the recovered taxes with respect to which such a payment may be made.
 - (4) Availability and use of death information [Caution: For postponement of effective date of this paragraph with respect to certain States, see P.L. 103-66, Sec. 13444(b), which appears as a note to this section.]. (A) In general. No returns or return information may be disclosed under paragraph (1) to any agency, body, or commission of any State (or any legal representative thereof) during any period during which a contract meeting the requirements of subparagraph (B) is not in effect between such State and the Secretary of Health and Human Services.
 - (B) Contractual requirements. A contract meets the requirements of this subparagraph if—
 - (i) such contract requires the State to furnish the Secretary of Health and Human Services information concerning individuals with respect to whom death certificates (or equivalent documents maintained by the State or any subdivision thereof) have been officially filed with it, and
 - (ii) such contract does not include any restriction on the use of information obtained by such Secretary pursuant to such contract, except that such contract may provide that such information is only to be used by the Secretary (or any other Federal agency) for

or the General Accounting Office or the Congressional Budget Office has failed to, or does not. meet the requirements of this paragraph, he may, after any proceedings for review established under paragraph (7), take such actions as are necessary to ensure such requirements are met, including refusing to disclose returns or return information to such agency, body, or commission including an agency or any other person described in subsection (1)(16) or (17), or the l Accounting Office or the Congressional Budget Office until he determines that such requirements have been or will be met. In the case of any agency which receives any mailing address under paragraph (2), (4), (6), or (7) of subsection (m) and which discloses any such mailing address to any agent, or which receives any information under paragraph (6)(A), (12)(B) or (16) of subsection (l) and which discloses any such information to any agent, or any person including an agent described in subsection (1)(16), this paragraph shall apply to such agency and each such agent or other person (except that, in the case of an agent, or any person including an agent described in subsection (1)(16), any report to the Secretary or other action with respect to the Secretary shall be made or taken through such agency). For purposes of applying this paragraph in any case to which subsection (m)(6) applies, the term "return information" includes related blood donor records (as defined in section 1141(h)(2) of the Social Security Act).

- (5) Report on procedures and safeguards. After the close of each calendar year, the Secretary shall furnish to each committee described in subsection (f)(1) a report which describes the procedures and safeguards established and utilized by such agencies, bodies, or commissions, the General Accounting Office, and the Congressional Budget Office for ensuring the confidentiality of returns and return information as required by this subsection. Such report shall also describe instances of deficiencies in, and failure to establish or utilize, such procedures.
- (6) Audit of procedures and safeguards. (A) Audit by Comptroller General. The Comptroller General may audit the procedures and safeguards established by such agencies, bodies, or commissions and the Congressional Budget Office pursuant to this subsection to determine whether such safeguards and procedures meet the requirements of this subsection and ensure the confidentiality of returns and return information. The Comptroller General shall notify the Secretary before any such audit is conducted.
 - (B) Records of inspection and reports by the Comptroller General. The Comptroller General shall—
 - (i) maintain a permanent system of standardized records and accountings of returns and return information inspected by officers and employees of the General Accounting Office under subsection (i)(8)(A)(ii) and shall, within 90 days after the close of each calendar year, furnish to the Secretary a report with respect to, or summary of, such records or accountings in such form and containing such information as the Secretary may prescribe, and
 - (ii) furnish an annual report to each committee described in subsection (f) and to the Secretary setting forth his findings with respect to any audit conducted pursuant to subparagraph (A).

The Secretary may disclose to the Joint Committee any report furnished to him under clause (i).

- (7) Administrative review. The Secretary shall by regulations prescribe procedures which provide for administrative review of any determination under paragraph (4) that any agency, body, or commission described in subsection (d) has failed to meet the requirements of such paragraph.
- (8) State law requirements. (A) Safeguards. Notwithstanding any other provision of this section, no return or return information shall be disclosed after December 31, 1978, to any officer or employee of any State which requires a taxpayer to attach to, or include in, any State tax return a copy of any portion of his Federal return, or information reflected on such Federal return, unless such State adopts provisions of law which protect the confidentiality of the copy of the Federal return (or portion thereof) attached to, or the Federal return information reflected on, such State tax return.

(B) Disclosure of returns or return information in state returns. Nothing in subparagraph (A) shall be construed to prohibit the disclosure by an officer or employee of any State of any copy of any portion of a Federal return or any information on a Federal return which is required to be attached or included in a State return to another officer or employee of such state (or political subdivision of such State) if such disclosure is specifically authorized by state law.

(q) Regulations. The Secretary is authorized to prescribe such other regulations as are necessary to carry out the provisions of this section.

(Aug. 16, 1954, ch 736, 68A Stat. 753; Sept. 2, 1964, P. L. 88-563, § 3(c), 78 Stat. 844; June 21, 1965, P. L. 89-44, Title VI, § 601(a), 79 Stat. 153; Nov. 2, 1966, P. L. 89-713, § 4(a), 80 Stat. 1109; Sept. 2, 1974, P. L. 93-406, Title II, § 1022(h), 88 Stat. 941; Jan. 2, 1976, P. L. 94-202,

Key